

2.6.1 Prove that if a sequence converges it has exactly one limit point. Is the converse true? Prove it or give a counterexample.

Lemma 2.6.1.a:

Let  $a < b$ . Then  $\exists \delta > 0 \ni a + \delta < b - \delta$ .

Proof of lemma 2.6.1.a:

Since  $a < b$ , we have:  $b - a > 0 \Rightarrow b - a > \frac{b-a}{2} > 0$ . Take  $\delta = \frac{b-a}{4}$ .

$\Rightarrow b - a > 2\delta \Rightarrow b - \delta > a + \delta$ . Q.E.D.

Proof of exercise 2.6.1: (existence)

Take  $\varepsilon > 0$  arbitrary,  $N \in \mathbf{N}$  arbitrary. Since  $a_n \rightarrow a$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we have that

$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \exists N^*(\varepsilon) \in \mathbf{N} \ni \forall n \geq N^*, |a_n - a| < \varepsilon$ .

Take  $n \geq \max\{N, N^*\}$ . Then  $|a_n - a| < \varepsilon$ . i.e.  $a$  is a limit point of the sequence  $\{a_n\}$ . Q.E.D.

Proof of exercise 2.6.1: (uniqueness)

Suppose  $\exists d, a$  which are limit points of the sequence  $\{a_n\}$ . That is,

$\forall \varepsilon > 0, \forall N \in \mathbf{N}, \exists n_1 \geq N \ni |a_{n_1} - a| < \varepsilon$  and  $\exists n_2 \geq N \ni |a_{n_2} - d| < \varepsilon$ .

Without loss of generality, assume that  $d < a$ .

$\Rightarrow \exists \delta > 0 \ni d + \delta < a - \delta$ . (By lemma 2.6.1.a)

Since  $a_n \rightarrow a$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we have that  $\forall \varepsilon > 0 \exists N^*(\varepsilon) \in \mathbf{N} \ni \forall n \geq N^*,$

$|a_n - a| < \varepsilon$ .

Let  $\varepsilon = \delta \Rightarrow \forall n \geq N^*(\delta), |a_n - a| < \delta \Rightarrow -\delta < a_n - a < \delta$

$\Rightarrow a - \delta < a_n < a + \delta$

$\Rightarrow d + \delta < a - \delta < a_n$

That is, if we let  $\varepsilon = \delta$  and  $N = N^*(\delta) \forall n \geq N^*(\delta), a_n \notin (d - \delta, d + \delta)$ .

Therefore,  $d$  is not a limit point of  $\{a_n\}$ , which is a contradiction  $\rightarrow \leftarrow$ .

Therefore, there can be at most one limit point of a convergent sequence. Q.E.D.

Counterexample:

Consider the sequence  $a_n = \begin{cases} 0 & n \text{ even} \\ n & n \text{ odd} \end{cases}$

$\{a_n\}$  has only one limit point:  $d = 0$ , but it does not converge.